BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 10631525 2

Cases on Evidence
(1985-86 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto.

LAW LIBRARY

AUG 15 1985

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Cases on Evidence
(1985-86 Edition)

Volume 2

Selected by Alan W. Mewett

These materials are intended for use in the Evidence course of Professor Mewett in the Faculty of Law of the University of Toronto.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesonevidence02mewe_2

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statutes	Page
Charter of Rights	1
Canada Evidence Act	2
Evidence Act of Ontario	10
1. Introduction	
Batary v. A.G. Sask., [1965] S.C.R. 465	24
Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318	28
Pappajohn (1980), 14 C.R.(3d) 243	29
Oakes (1983), 2 C.C.C.(3d) 339	33
Morris (1984), 36 C.R.(3d) 1	41
2. Competence, Compellability and Oaths	
Gosselin (1907), 7 C.C.C. 139	50
McConnell and Beer, [1968] S.C.R. 802	53
Vezeau, [1977] 2 S.C.R. 277	57
Hoskyn v. M.P.C., [1978] 2 W.L.R. 695	58
Bowles (1967), 50 C.R. 353	59
Sillars (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 202	61
Czipps (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 193	63
McNamara (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 210	67
Fellichle (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 207	70
Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293	72
McLaughlin (1974), 24 C.R.N.S. 362	73
Walsh (1979), 45 C.C.C.(2d) 199	77
Gunewardene, [1951] 2 K.B. 600	81
Toohey v. M.P.C., [1965] A.C. 595	83
Hawke (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 1	87
Sankey (1927), 48 C.C.C. 97	92
Budin (1981), 58 C.C.C.(2d) 352 (Ont.C.A.)	94
Kendall, [1962] S.C.R. 469	96
3. Refreshing Memory	
McInroy and Rouse (1977), 5 C.R.(3d) 125	98
Davey (1969), 6 C.R.N.S. 288	101
Bengert (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 21; 15 C.R.(3d) 114 at 160	104
4. Credibility	
(a) Expert Evidence	
Wilband, [1967] 2 C.C.C. 6	106
Rosik (1971), 13 C.R.N.S. 129	108
Abbey (1982), 43 N.R. 30	116
Phillion (1977), 37 C.R.N.S. 361	122
(b) Enhancing Credibility	
Clark (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 183	126
Kyselka, [1962] O.W.N. 164	132
Corke v. Corke, [1958] 1 All E.R. 224	133
Welstead v. Brown, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 3	135
Pappin (1970), 12 C.R.N.S. 287 (Ont.C.A.).	137
Rozich (1980), 10 C.R.(3d) 364	138
Giraldi (1975), 28 C.C.C.(2d) 248	141
(c) Complaints in Sexual Cases	
Sexual Offences Act	144
Timm (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 396 (S.C.C.)	144
Page (1984), 40 C.R.(3d) 85	147
(d) Prior Inconsistent Statements	
Deacon (1947), S.C.R. 531	152
McInroy and Rouse, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 588	153
Wawanesa v. Hanes, [1961] O.R. 495	158
Milgaard (1971), 14 C.R.N.S. 34	161
Cronshaw (1977), 3 C.C.C.(2d) 183 (Prov.Ct.)	165

Credibility (contd)	Page
(e) Prior Convictions	
Criminal Code s.593	166
D'Aoust (1902), 5 C.C.C. 407	166
Koufis (1941), S.C.R. 481	167
Titchner, [1961] O.R. 606	168
St. Pierre (1974), 17.C.C.C.(2d) 489	170
Morris (1979), 43 C.C.C.(2d) 129	172
(f) Prior Sexual Conduct	
Criminal Code ss. 246.6, 246.7	183
Laliberte, [1877] 1 S.C.R. 117	184
Forsythe (1980), 15 C.R.(3d) 219	186
(g) Accused Attacking own Credibility	
French (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 201	191
Helpard (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 76	196
Dietrich (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 129	198
R. v. K. (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 436	203
5. Character	
McNamara (1981) 56 C.C.C.(2d) 193	208
Guay (1978), 42 C.C.C.(2d) 536	215
Taylor (1982), 35 O.R.(2d) 738 (Ont.C.A.)	217
Glynn (1971), 15 C.R.N.S. 343	219
Lupien (1970), 9 C.R. 165	220
Lowery, [1973] 3 W.L.R. 235	225
McMillan (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 191	230
Robertson (1975), 29 C.R.N.S. 141	235
6. Similar Fact Evidence	
Criminal Code Section 312, 314(1)(b), 317, 318	237
Makin, [1894] A.C. 57	238
Smith (1916), 11 Cr. Ap. Rep. 229	241
Sweitzer (1982), 68 C.C.C.(2d) 193	242
Boardman, [1975] A.C. 421	246
Leblanc (1975), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 97	250
Cloutier (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 10	254
Straffen, [1952] 2 Q.B. 911	260
Scopelliti (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 481	263
MacDonald v. Canada Kelp (1974), 39 D.L.R.(3d) 617	270
Hoffman article, (1975), 91 L.Q.R. 193	275
7. Hearsay	
(i) General	
Myers v. D.P.P., [1965] A.C. 1001	284
Ares v. Venner, [1970] S.C.R. 608	289
Subramaniam, [1956] 1 W.L.R. 965	291
Wright v. Tatham (1837), 112 E.R. 488	293
Wysochan (1930), 54 C.C.C. 172	296
Wildman (1984), 14 C.C.C.(3d) 321	298
Ratten, [1972] A.C. 378	308
(ii) Res Gestae	
Bedingfield (1879), 14 Cox C.C. 341	312
Gilbert (1907), 38 S.C.R. 284	314
Leland, [1951] O.R. 12	316
Hodd (1970), 1 C.C.C.(3d) 363	321
Graham (1972), 7 C.C.C.(2d) 93	325
Newton (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 161	330
Risby (1977), 32 C.C.C.(2d) 242	332
Keeler (1978), 36 C.C.C.(2d) 8	333
Clark (1983), 35 C.R.(3d) 357	336
(iii) Statements Against Interest	
Donnelly v. U.S. (1913), 228 U.S. 243	352

Hearsay (contd) — Page

Agawa (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 293 — 354
Demeter (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 137 — 357
O'Brien (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 209 — 359
Pelletier (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 515 — 362
Lucier (1982), 65 C.C.C.(2d) 150 — 364

(iv) Prior Proceedings

Criminal Code S.S. 643, 541 — 366
Walkerton v. Erdman (1894), 23 S.C.R. 352 — 367
Hollington v. Hewthorn (1943), 1 K.B. 587 — 370
Goody v. Odhams Press, [1967] 1 Q.B. 333 — 374
Gushue (1980), 50 C.C.C.(2d) 417 — 374
English v. Richmond, [1956] S.C.R. 383 — 378
Re Charlton, [1969] C.C.C.(2d) 1 — 381
Humphrys, [1976] 2 All E.R. 497 — 383
Kienapple (1974), 15 C.C.C.(2d) 524 — 385

(v) Bodily and Mental Condition

Youlden (1912), 260 L.R. 75 — 387
Mutual Life v. Hillmon (1892), 145 U.S. 285 — 389
Wainwright (1875), 13 Cox C.C. 171 — 391
Thomson, [1912] 3 K.B. 19 — 392
Home v. Corbeil, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 750 — 393

(vi) Business Records

Vanlerberghe (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 222 — 395
McMullen (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 499 — 396
Civil Evidence Act (U.K.); Computer Evidence (S.Africa) — 402
Wood (1983), 76 Cr.App.R. 23 — 403

8. Confessions and Pre-Trial Statements

(i) General

Piché (1971), S.C.R. 23 — 406

(ii) Persons in Authority

Towler (1968), 5 C.R.N.S. 55 — 409
Pettipiece (1972), 18 C.R.N.S. 236 — 410
Rothman (1981), 1 S.C.R. 640 — 414
Collins (1976), 29 C.C.C.(2d) 304 — 417
Perras (1973), 11 C.C.C.(2d) 245 — 419
Stewart (1980), 54 C.C.C.(2d) 93 — 421

(iii) The Voir Dire

Thiffault (1933), 60 C.C.C. 97 — 424
Kacherowski (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 257 — 426
Conkie (1978), 38 C.C.C.(2d) 408 — 428
Wert (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 254 — 430

(iv) Need for Voir Dire

Sweezey (1974), 27 C.R.N.S. 163 — 431
Powell (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 323 — 433
Erven (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 97 — 435
Morris (1979), 10 C.R.(3d) 59 — 446
Boulet (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 345 — 449
Watson (1980), 1 W.L.R. 991 — 451
Price (1981) 59 C.C.C.(2d) 367 (Ont.Co.Ct.) — 454
Park (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 385 (S.C.C.) — 456

(v) Timing of the Voir Dire

Bruno (1976), 27 C.C.C.(2d) 318 — 460

Confessions etc. (contd). Page

(vi) Voluntariness

Ibrahim, [1914] A.C. 599 461
Horvath (1979), 44 C.C.C.(2d) 385 464
Prager (1972), 1 All E.R. 1114 472
Serack (1973), 24 C.R.N.S. 295 474
Washer (1948), 92 C.C.C. 218 475
Ward (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 153 476
Zanella (1981), 55 C.C.C.(2d) 567 479
Nagotcha (1980), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 353 482
Rothman (1981), 35 N.R. 485 483
Amato (1983), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 31 487
Griffin (1981), 59 C.C.C.(2d) 503 490
Marshall (1960), 127 C.C.C. 76 493

(vii) Charter Cases

Crossman v. The Queen (1984), 12 C.C.C.(3d) 547 495
Anderson (1984), 10 C.C.C.(3d) 417 502
Lessard (1984), 10 C.C.C.(3d) 62 510

(viii) Truth of Confession

Hammond, [1941] 3 All E.R. 318 525
Hnedish (1958), 26 W.W.R. 685 527
De Clerq, [1968] S.C.R. 902 529
Wong Kam-Ming, [1979] 2 W.L.R. 81 533

(ix) Confessions Confirmed by Subsequent Facts

St. Lawrence (1949), 93 C.C.C. 376 538
Wray (1970), 11 C.R.N.S. 235 541

(x) Use of Confessions

Jackson (1980), 57 C.C.C.(2d) 154 548
Herodotu (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 336 553
Ma, Ho and Lai (1979), 6 C.R.(3d) 325. 557

(xi) Use of Voir Dire evidence at Trial

Van Dongen (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 346 561
Gauthier (1976), 33 C.R.N.S. 46 563
Magdish (1978) 41 C.C.C.(2d) 392 566
Brophy (1981), 2 All E.R. 705 567
Tarrant (1982), 63 C.C.C.(2d) 385 570

(xii) Adopted Statements and Silence

Chapdelaine (1935), 63 C.C.C.5 572
Fargnoli, [1957] O.R. 140 573
Govedarov (1974), 16 C.C.C.(2d) 238 574
Eden, [1970] 3 C.C.C.280 575
Sweeney (1977), 35 C.C.C.(2d) 245 577
Christie, [1914] A.C. 545 580
Sayegh (No.3) (1982), 69 C.C.C.(2d) 84 582
Parkes (1977), 64 Cr.App.R. 25 584
Gottschall (1983), 10 C.C.C.(2d) 447 585

(xiii) Consciousness of Guilt and Lies

Burdick (1975) 27 C.C.C. (2d) 497 598
Sparrow (1979), 12 C.R. (3d) 158 601

(xiv) Conditional Admissibility

Carter (1982), 67 C.C.C. (2d) 568 603

(xv) Guilty Plea

Dietrich (1970) 11 C.R.N.S. 22 607
Rimmer (1972), 1 All E.R. 604 609
Pentiluk (1975), 28 C.R.N.S. 324 611

9. Admissions

Divorce Act, s.9 613

Admissions (contd)	Page
Yorkton v. Morley (1967), 66 D.L.R.(2d) 37	613
Strand Electric, [1969] 2 C.C.C. 264	615
10. Privilege	
Slavutych v. Baker (1977), 38 C.R.N.S. 306	617
Descoteaux v. Mierzwinski (1982), 44 N.R. 462	621
Shenton v. Tyler, [1939] Ch. 620	625
Rumping v. D.P.P., [1962] 3 All E.R. 256	627
St. Jean (1976), 34 C.R.N.S. 378	629
Akey (1980), 12 C.R.(3d) 240	631
Jean (1979), 7 C.R.(3d) 333; (1980) 16 C.R.(3d) 193	634
Lloyd (1982), 64 C.C.C.(2d) 169	636
Reference re Legislative Privilege (1978), 39 C.C.C.(2d) 222	638
Health Records (1982), 62 C.C.C.(2d) 193	642
11. State Secrets	
Duncan v. Cammell, Laird, [1942] A.C. 624	646
Conway v. Rimmer, [1963] A.C. 910	649
Mannix (1982), 126 D.L.R.(3d) 155	654
Re Goguen (1982) 10 C.C.C. (3d) 492	657
Canada Evidence Act Sections 36.1 to 36.3	667
12. Improperly Obtained Evidence	
Kuruma, [1955] A.C. 197	669
Sang, [1980] A.C. 402	671
Lawrie v. Muir, [1950] S.L.T. 37	675
Bunning v. Cross (1978), 52 A.L.J.R. 561	676
Criminal Code Sections 178.16, 178.2	677
Stewart (1981), 60 C.C.C.(2d) 407	679
Dass (1979), 47 C.C.C.(2d) 194	681
Goldman (1979), 51 C.C.C.(2d) 1	682
Hogan (1979), 18 C.C.C.(2d) 65	686
12a. Charter Cases	
Hunter v. Southam (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 97	692
Rao (1984) 12 C.C.C. (3d) 97	702
13. Corroboration	
Criminal Code Sections 246.4, 586	720
Baskerville, [1916] 2 K.B. 658	720
Ethier, [1959] O.R. 533	722
Hester, [1972] 3 All E.R. 1056	725
Kilbourne, [1973] 1 All E.R. 440	728
Warkentin (1976), 30 C.C.C.(2d) 1	732
Vetrovec (1982), 67 C.C.C.(2d) 1	736
14. Real Evidence	
Yachuk v. Blaise, [1944] O.W.N. 412	746
Draper v. Jacklyn, [1968] 2 O.R. 683	747
Parsons (1977), 40 C.R.N.S. 202	749
15. Judicial Notice	
Varcoe v. Lee (1919), 180 Cal. 338	752
Savidant (1945), 19 M.P.R. 448	756
16. Miscellaneous Problems in the Trial Process	
Cooper (1977), 34 C.C.C.(2d) 18	758
LeMay, [1952] 1 S.C.R. 232	764
Browne v. Dunn (1893), 6 R. 67	768
Dyck, [1970] 2 C.C.C. 283	770
Mete (1973), 22 C.R.N.S. 387	771
Angelantoni (1975), 31 C.R.N.S. 342	774
Dobberthien (1973), 13 C.C.C.(2d) 513	775
Sparre (1978), 37 C.C.C.(2d) 495	779